

TERMS

PART 1

FALL 2021

Service

Dallal Boukhari
*What Public Service
in Québec?*

Les Levine
*Catalogue of
Services*

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine's
Services*

TERMS

PART 1

FALL 2021

For its second edition, the discursive and artistic program *Terms* focuses on the notion of “service.” This word, which is taken as a given in our lives and shapes nearly all of our social interactions, historically refers to the state of subjection and obedience that binds one to a higher authority—a master, the law, the State, God. In its usual sense, it refers more broadly to a commitment to others or to oneself: made out of desire or obligation, with or without self-interest, at the level of the individual or of society. Today the word prevails,

SERVICE

perhaps above all, in the market economy, where it translates into a transactional object dictated by imperatives of profitability, performance, innovation, general interest, and, occasionally, public utility.

In whose names does a service act? This edition of *Terms* looks at some of the meanings conferred to the concept of “service,” considering the principles on which it can be linked, in particular those of equality, accessibility, benevolence, but also devotion, sacrifice, economy and competition.

This first of two parts is concerned with the social value of service, understood as a system of provisions, both delivered and received, conditioned by political and market interests. It includes texts by doctor of law and postdoctoral researcher Dallal Boukhari, and by professor and art historian Alex Kitnick, in dialogue with artist Les Levine’s *Catalogue of Services*, produced in 1972 under the institutional identity of the Museum of Mott Art, Inc.

Dallal Boukhari

What Public Service in Québec?

1. Pierre Bernier, “Rappel utile de quelques fondamentaux sur les services publics à l’heure de la remise en cause,” *Télescope* 14, no. 2 (2007-2008): 2.
2. *Ibid.*, (our translation).
3. Dorian Guinard, “Réflexions actuelles sur la notion de service public,” *Regards croisés sur l’économie* 2, no. 2 (2007): 39.

Dallal Boukhari
*What Public Service
 in Québec?*

In every State, public authorities provide various public services to their citizens. These are subject to regulations set by the government. As a result, it is up to the State to determine what provisions are designated as “public services,” thus giving all individuals access to a range of essential services of general (public) interest, with the goal of ensuring the social, economic, and cultural cohesion of society.¹ Education, health, transportation, safety, communication, energy, and other social services, are generally considered public services.

It should be noted from the outset that there is no unequivocal definition of this notion. Each State defines and interprets the scope of its public services based on parameters that take into account economic, legal, historical, cultural, and ideological factors, for instance. Also, the notion of public service is relative, it “is by nature evolving in space and time”² and is considered a notion of “open texture [...] the contours of which cannot be defined *a priori*, which leaves a substantial margin of appreciation to an interpreting authority.”³ This notion of “open texture” allows a given State to define and interpret the principles that guide public service based on its own vision of these principles.

4. For a definition of these principles, see Lia Caponetti and Barbara Sak, “Comment définir le service public à travers ses différentes facettes, missions et principes?” CIRIEC international, 2016 report, 14-17, <http://www.ciriec.uliege.be/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/WP2016-06FR.pdf>.
5. James Iain Gow, “La notion de service public au Québec à l’ère de la gouvernance,” *Télescope* 14, no. 2 (2007-2008): 40-41. See also Lia Caponetti and Barbara Sak, *ibid*.
6. Public service in Québec is defined as: “Any activity undertaken by the Administration in the general interest, whether it be directly by a public entity or positively controlled by it,” in *Essai sur le service public*, ed. Patrice Garant (Québec: Presses de l’Université Laval, 1966), 27 (our translation).

Dallal Boukhari
*What Public Service
 in Québec?*

It would appear that public service is influenced by the political interpretation of its principles by the State. Equality, neutrality, accessibility, and adaptability⁴ are among the constructive principles that guide a public service.⁵ In some cases, however, the interpretation given to the principles of equality and neutrality have the effect of restricting certain individual rights and freedoms. This restriction namely concerns the right to freedom of religion of State employees, as well as individuals who receive a public service.

For this reason, we will examine these two principles to learn how they are interpreted and applied, and what justifications are put forward by the State in how it interprets them. Québec⁶ provides a good example for interpreting the principles of equality and neutrality, how the concept of “public service” is relative, and how the political interpretation of these principles affects how service is provided and received within public institutions.

7. The *Québec Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms*, RLQ c C-12, art. 10 stipulates that: “Every person has a right to full and equal recognition and exercise of his human rights and freedoms, without distinction, exclusion or preference based on race, colour, sex, gender identity or expression, pregnancy, sexual orientation, civil status, age except as provided by law, religion, political convictions, language, ethnic or national origin, social condition, a handicap or the use of any means to palliate a handicap. Discrimination exists where such a distinction, exclusion or preference has the effect of nullifying or impairing such right.” Ibid.

8. Louis-Philippe Lampron, “Convictions religieuses individuelles versus égalité entre les sexes : ambiguïtés du droit québécois et canadien,” in *Appartenances religieuses, appartenance citoyenne : un équilibre en tension*, eds. Paul Eid, Pierre Bosset and Micheline Milot (Québec: Presses de l’Université Laval, 2009), 221.

9. For more on the term “material equality,” see Pierre Bosset and Madeleine Caron, “Un nouvel outil de lutte contre la discrimination :

Equality is a principle that guarantees access to public services for all users and employees, without distinction. Embedded in article 10⁷ of the *Quebec Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms*, the right to equality guarantees every individual the right to full and equal recognition and exercise of their rights and freedoms without distinction, exclusion or preference based on any of the grounds set out in section 10, including freedom of religion. The principle of equality applied in Québec goes beyond formal equality,⁸ and is instead aimed at real or material equality;⁹ it is a question of “equality in difference.”¹⁰ Indeed, to achieve this equality, differential treatment can be applied to guarantee that individuals have access to public services. In fact, the Supreme Court of Canada confirmed this position in its judgment on *Weatherall v. Canada (Attorney General)*, explaining that “equality does not necessarily imply identical treatment, and in fact, different treatment may be necessary in some cases to promote equality.”¹¹ To put this interpretation of the right to equality into practice, reasonable accommodation is used.¹²

les programmes d'accès à l'égalité," *Revue juridique Thémis* 21 (1987): 77. On the term "real equality," see Lampron, *supra* note 7, 221.

10. Québec, Consultation Commission on Accommodation Practices Related to Cultural Differences, *Building a Future: A Time for Reconciliation*, Government of Québec, 2008, 63, <https://numerique.banq.qc.ca/patrimoine/details/52327/1565995>.

11. *Weatherall v. Canada (Attorney General)*, 2 SCR 872, 1993 (our translation).

12. Reasonable accommodation is defined as: "a *legal obligation*, applicable in a situation of *discrimination*, to accommodate a standard of practice of universal application within reason, by granting differential treatment to a person who would otherwise be penalized by the application of such a standard," quoted in Pierre Bosset, "La 'crise' des accommodements raisonnables : Regards d'un juriste sur le rapport Bouchard-Taylor," *JPPPL* 3, no. 2 (2009): 332. (our translation). See also the concept of reasonable accommodation and

It was on this basis that, until 2019, the wearing of religious symbols was authorized in public institutions in Québec. The *Multani*¹³ case on the wearing of religious symbols in public schools is a conclusive example of the application of the principle of equality within a public service setting. In this case, the use of reasonable accommodation was chosen by the Supreme Court in order to protect the individuals against discrimination that could result from social norms and that could prevent the individuals from accessing and benefitting from public services. Furthermore, this interpretation of equality allowed these individuals to provide public services without having the wearing of religious symbols be an impediment to carrying out their duties. It must be noted that this direction has changed since Québec's secularism law¹⁴ (Bill 21) was passed in 2019.

RELIGIOUS NEUTRALITY VERSUS SECULARISM IN PUBLIC SERVICE

Until very recently, the State's religious neutrality was in some ways the functional equivalent of secularism in Québec.¹⁵ This neutrality was intended to guarantee

its application in Québec in Dallal Boukhari, “Études de la compatibilité de la laïcité française au Québec à partir de la Charte des valeurs québécoises” (PhD diss., Archipel UQAM, PhD in Law, 2018), 234-246, <https://archipel.uqam.ca/11453/1/D3374.pdf>.

13. *Multani v. Commission scolaire*, 2006 SCC 6.

14. *Act Respecting the Laicity of the State*, L.Q. 2019, c. 12 [Bill 21]. See also Dallal Boukhari, “L’école publique au Québec, la laïcité et l’intégration,” *Revue du droit des religions*, no. 10 (2020): 135-140.

15. Pierre Bosset, “Le Québec a-t-il besoin d’une loi sur la laïcité? Les fondements juridiques de la laïcité québécoise,” in *Penser la laïcité québécoise: fondements et défense d’une laïcité ouverte au Québec*, ed. Sébastien Lévesque (Québec: Presses de l’Université Laval, 2014), 159.

16. The neutrality of the State signifies that « the State must tolerate cultural and religious differences and remain neutral in their regard. Moreover, it cannot impose the guiding values or ideas by enacting laws that

freedom of religion. However, recent political interpretation of religious neutrality and secularism within Québec’s public service led to an application that goes against these said principles, which have long been known and applied in Québec.¹⁶ In 2019, the Legault government passed Bill 21 under a gag order and with the use of the notwithstanding clause¹⁷ in order to prohibit people in positions of authority from wearing religious symbols.¹⁸ Among those subject to this measure are public school teachers, principals, and vice-principals. The law requires that faces be uncovered¹⁹ in the delivering or receiving of a public service; therefore, the prohibition applies to the users of these services as well. Moreover, Bill 21 prohibits any reasonable accommodation on religious grounds that relates to the prohibition of wearing religious symbols or face coverings under the Act.

Requiring that users uncover their faces in order to receive public services, with absolutely no accommodations, certainly puts some individual groups at a disadvantage due to their religious beliefs²⁰ and prevents them from enjoying their rights and freedoms, such as their right to access “the goods and services ordinarily

favour one culture or one religion.” Sophie Gervais and Mélanie Roy, “Au-delà des diversités culturelles et religieuses, la nécessité d’une identité québécoise,” in *Le droit face aux diversités religieuses et culturelles*, eds. Sophie Gervais and Martin Lagacé (Québec: Les Éditions Revue de Droit Université de Sherbrooke, 1996), 20-21. See the concept of neutrality and its application in Québec in Dallal Boukhari, *supra* note 11, chapter IV, 204-209.

17. The notwithstanding clause is a measure that allows a legislator to override certain sections of the Canadian and Québec charters of rights and freedoms. The exemption is included in article 52 of the *Québec Charter*.

18. See Schedule II of Bill 21, *supra* note 13.

19. See Schedule III of Bill 21, *ibid*.

20. Canadian Muslim Lawyers Association, *Memorandum on Bill 62. An Act to foster adherence to State religious neutrality and, in particular, to provide a framework for requests for accommodations on religious grounds in certain organizations*, November 2016, 6.

available to the public, as well as the right to access public spaces to obtain the goods and services offered there.”²¹ Muslim women who wear the niqab²² are particularly affected by this type of ban, which further contributes to their exclusion and stigmatisation.²³

The secular nature of the State underlying Bill 21 extends to public service employees and users via a supposedly neutral appearance that is free of any religious symbols. This notion of secularism is inconsistent with the principle of religious neutrality already established in Québec, which emphasizes service neutrality²⁴ without requiring the neutrality of an employee’s or user’s appearance. A public service employee must provide a neutral service that is free of any religious influence or orientation. During the debates on Bill 60 on the *Québec Charter of Values* in 2013 the Human Rights Commission clearly explained the understanding of the religious neutrality of the State within public service:

The requirement of religious neutrality applies first of all to State institutions and their norms and practices. However, government officials are not subject to it, except by the requiring of impartiality in the

21. Commission des droits de la personne et des droits de la jeunesse [Human Rights and Youth Rights Commission], *Mémoire sur le Projet de loi n° 62. Loi favorisant le respect de la neutralité religieuse de l'État et visant notamment à encadrer les demandes d'accommodements religieux dans certains organismes*, novembre 2015, 37 (our translation), www.cdpdj.qc.ca/Publications/memoire_PL_62_neutralite_religieuse_Etat.pdf.

22. The niqab is a religious symbol in the form of a veil that covers the face below the eyes.

23. In its *Memorandum on Bill 62*, the Human Rights Commission explains that it has reviewed the issue of requiring the removal of face coverings on several occasions and has concluded each time that such a requirement negatively impacts Muslim women who wear the niqab. The Commission has expressed this view in Bill 94 (2010), Bill 60 (2013), and Bill 62 (2015). See the Human Rights Commission summary (in French only) *Mémoire sur le projet de loi 62*, 38-40.

24. See the Bouchard-Taylor Report, *supra* note 9, and Jocelyn Maclure

performance of their duties, by the obligations relating to the duty of confidentiality that some of them have, as well as by prohibiting any proselytization. According to jurisprudence, proselytizing refers to the teaching and propagation of beliefs. [...] It is unreasonable to presume bias in a government employee simply because he or she wears a religious symbol.²⁵

In Québec, secularism stems from the religious neutrality of the State, which guarantees the freedom of religion and conscience of individuals.²⁶ In this sense, “the finality of secularism thus becomes the protection of the freedom of conscience and religion and the right to equality. Consequently, all attempts to enshrine secularism within a legal framework must have the effect of respecting the fundamental rights and freedoms of all persons.”²⁷

In that respect, the new interpretation and application of secularism in Bill 21 compels us to think more deeply about the effects this orientation has on the principles that characterize public service, especially equality, accessibility, and adaptability.²⁸ Generally

and Charles Taylor, *Secularism and Freedom of Conscience* (originally published as *Laïcité et liberté de conscience*), trans. Jane Marie Todd (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2011).

25. Commission des droits de la personne et droits de la jeunesse, *Commentaires sur le document gouvernemental. Parce que nos valeurs, on y croit. Orientations gouvernementales en matière d'encadrement des demandes d'accommodement religieux, d'affirmation des valeurs de la société québécoise ainsi que du caractère laïque des institutions de l'État*, October 16, 2013 (our translation), http://www.cdpedj.gc.ca/Publications/Commentaires_orientations_valeurs.pdf.

26. José Woehrling, “L’obligation d’accommodement raisonnable et l’adaptation de la société à la diversité religieuse,” *McGill Law Journal* 43, no. 3 (1998): 371.

27. Human Rights Commission, *supra* note 25, 6-7 (our translation).

28. For a definition of these principles, see Lia Caponetti and Barbara Sak, *supra* note 4, 14-17.

speaking, public service adapts itself to accommodate changes in information and communications technology (ICT) or the needs of users and employees, and it must remain accessible to all without discrimination or exclusion. Unjustified infringements on fundamental human rights based on political choices and orientations, as defined by Bill 60 of the *Québec Charter of Values* from the Marois government in 2013 and the recent Bill 21 from the Legault government, demonstrate the vulnerability of public service when it comes to protecting the rights and freedoms of individuals, and the need to reconsider this protection so that public service corresponds with its essential principles and is protected from the vagaries of politics.

—Translated from French by Jo-Anne Balcaen

DALLAL BOUKHARI is a doctor of law and a postdoctoral researcher in the Department of Legal Sciences at the Université du Québec à Montréal (UQAM). She also works for the scientific journal *Communitas* and is a consultant for community organizations. Her research primarily looks at public institutions, law enforcement, and the protection of human rights and freedoms. Boukhari is currently pursuing a Specialized Graduate Diploma (DESS) in public/private sector management as part of the joint program offered by HEC-ÉNAP.

Les Levine
*Catalogue of
Services*

LEVINE (MOTT)

CATALOGUE OF SERVICES 1972

Office hours: 9 to 5, Mon - Fri
Price \$1

Museum Of Mott Art inc.

CONDITIONS OF SERVICE AND CONSULTATION

Museum of Mott Art is a consultation service organization, the purpose of which is to provide information and consultation services to the fine art professions and their associates.

1. All services are given on an individual basis only. Lists or other information supplied by Mott Art are deemed to be for the client's use only and not transferable.
2. All inquiries, consultations or conversations between clients and Mott Art shall be held in the strictest of confidence.
3. Information supplied by Mott Art is given in accordance with the highest professional standards. Where an expert is required, a bona fide member of the specific profession will be consulted. Mott Art shall not be held responsible for the outcome of any actions taken as a result of the client receiving information or acting upon the use of any of our services.
4. Fees are charged as per catalog prices or \$30 per hour, whichever is the greater. Where particular expertise from a qualified professional is required, the standard hourly rate of that profession shall be charged in addition. All telephone inquiries are billed at \$5 per call. Fees are payable immediately as service is supplied.

MUSEUM OF MOTT ART
181 Mott Street, New York 10012
(212) 925-0447
Office hours: 9 to 5, Mon - Fri

1. FOUNDATIONS AND SCHOLARSHIPS

How to apply to major foundations for specific projects. A list of documents and papers and other material that should be included in any presentation to a foundation or an institute.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

2. ART SUPPLIES FOR PLASTIC ARTISTS

Where to buy the raw materials, resins, sheets, blocks, tubes, etc. Where to have a specific material fabricated. Who to consult for specific problems in fabrication, i.e. chemical engineers, mold makers, etc. What specific plastic should be used for a particular project.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

3. DEALING WITH DEALERS - FOR ARTISTS

A complete assessment of your business relationship with your dealer, including analysis of income ratio to work supplied, deductions being made, acceptable practices, just plain ripoffs and contractual fulfillments.

Fee - \$35
925-0447 for appt

4. ART REMOVAL SERVICE

A Mott Art representative will visit your home and remove works of art to the improvement of the remaining art.

Fee - \$40
925-0447 for appt

5. ART FOR CAPITAL GAINS

An analysis of the various works over the period of the last 10 years that have increased in value and advice on what is purchaseable today for capital gains tailored to the client's investment budget. When to buy, when to sell.

Fee - \$100
925-0447 for appt

6. HOW TO COMMISSION WORKS

Choosing the right artist, establishing a fee, getting exactly what you want. Museum of Mott Art will act as your agent in the commissioning of works.

Fee - \$90 plus 5%
925-0447 for appt

7. ART VIEWING ESCORT SERVICE

A group of 3 people, male or female, of the client's choice shall escort the client for one day of viewing art in museums and galleries. The escorts will engage in conversation about the art with the client supportive to his own opinion about the works.

Fee - \$200
925-0447 for appt

8. QUESTIONS

How to ask an artist about his work without offending him. Four hour private consultation only.

Fee - \$120
925-0447 for appt

9. HOW TO BECOME AN ARTIST'S SPOUSE

A general outline on behavior attractive to artistic types. Where to meet them, how to hold on to them and how to get them to pop the question.

Fee - \$30
925-0447 for appt

10. SIGHT SAVER SPECIAL

A comprehensive list of what not to look at for the next year, tailored to the needs of the individual.

Fee - \$10
925-0447 for appt

11. ART SUPPLIES FOR PRINTMAKERS

Where are the best shops for silkscreen printing. Where lithography can be done. Where to obtain special papers. How to use offset and industrial techniques and still maintain a fine print look.

Fee - \$15
925-0447 for appt

12. CHILDREN'S ART EDUCATION

An assessment of the most suitable art educational program for your children. Directives and advice on how to proceed with a beneficial program.

Fee - \$50
925-0447 for appt

13. APPRECIATION SERVICE

How you can obtain the most enjoyment from art without desiring to own it.

Fee - \$30
925-0447 for appt

14. PLEASURE PURCHASE SERVICE

A careful study of the client's taste and desires in art will be made and advice given on the correct purchases to satisfy that taste.

Fee - \$60
925-0447 for appt

15. ART COLLECTING SERVICE

The steps that should be taken for the establishment of an important art collection and how its owner can become famous as an art collector.

Fee - \$90
925-0447 for appt

16. DEALING WITH DEALERS - FOR ART BUYERS

How to obtain discounts, how to obtain a first look at all desirable works before they are offered at public exhibit. How to hold things on reserve for possible purchase for prolonged periods. How to induce art dealers to invoice works of art for the maximum tax benefit to yourself. How to obtain up to a year's free credit from your dealer and still be a most welcome customer. How to return works of art when you change your mind.

Fee - \$30
925-0447 for appt

17. HOW TO BECOME A MUSEUM CURATOR

What shows should be done for advancement in the curator's career. What artists should be included in these shows. How to establish a firm curatorial position in just 3 exhibitions.

Fee - \$30
925-0447 for appt

18. ART SUPPLIES FOR EARTH ARTISTS

Where major earth excavation equipment can be rented. How to lease land and advice on legal procedures necessary. A list of photographers most experienced in photographing earth art.

Fee - \$15
925-0447 for appt

19. ART PATRON SERVICE

A list of artists, art activities and art projects worthy of patronage tailored to suit the patron's budget.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

20. FRIENDSHIP

How to develop rapport with artists and other inhabitants of the art world. What to say and what not to say for the establishment of a close relationship with artistic types.

Fee - \$40
925-0447 for appt

21. HOME DECORATING SERVICE

A Mott Art staff member will visit your home and outline a plan for re-decoration. We will also undertake to oversee the entire re-decoration at a slightly higher fee.

Fee - \$90
925-0447 for appt

22. HOW TO BECOME AN ART DEALER

The necessary information needed for the establishment of a retail art concern and how to make that concern a profitable business.

Fee - \$90
925-0447 for appt

23. FRAMING SERVICE

Where to get your pictures framed inexpensively. Good quality framing at prices usually associated with lesser quality work.

Fee - \$10
925-0447 for appt

24. HOW TO AVOID BECOMING AN ARTIST'S SPOUSE

How to enjoy close relationships with artists for maximum social and other pleasures without getting too close for comfort.

Fee - \$50
925-0447 for appt

25. HOW TO BECOME A CRITIC

Who you should write about. How to establish the name of an art movement or style that will be synonymous with your name. What publications you should write for.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

26. NEXT WAVE

How to estimate what changes will occur in art one year before they happen.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

27. ART SUPPLIES FOR PAINTERS

Where to buy paint, canvas, stretchers. Who has the best prices, who delivers, who gives credit. Where to buy silkscreens, what quantities should be purchased for maximum economy.

Fee - \$10
925-0447 for appt

28. GUEST LIST

A specific list tailored to the interest of the host. What critics mix with what artists, dealers, museum personnel, etc. Who to include, who to leave out.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

29. HOW TO BECOME AN ARTIST

Where to find housing, clothes you should wear, places you should eat and drink, people you should befriend, attitudes you should develop, how to interest dealers in your work.

Fee - \$30
925-0447 for appt

30. PRICE INCREASE SERVICE

Mott Art personnel will attend all auctions or sales in which your works are offered. Mott Art will bid on your behalf on these works until the bidding has reached market level thereby maintaining the retail price of your works.

Fee - 5%
925-0447 for appt

31. WHERE TO BE SEEN

The places you should be seen from time to time and the places you should never go, not even once!

Fee - \$10
925-0447 for appt

32. ART EXPERIENCE DAY

A group of activities suited to the particular client. The activities have been esthetically formulated in such a way as to produce an art experience for the client.

Fee - \$45
925-0447 for appt

33. MUSEUM JOBS

How to obtain employment from a major museum as a guard, cashier, information personnel, book seller, cloak room attendant, waitress, or elevator operator.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

34. DEALING WITH CLIENTS - FOR DEALERS

How to dissuade clients from even asking for discounts. How to invoice works of art for maximum tax benefit for both you and your artist. How to get clients to commission works. How to get art collectors to pay C.O.D. How to make a work of art so desirable that the client cannot resist purchase. How to keep them coming back for more of the same at constantly increasing prices. How to make a client feel privileged by a pre-exhibit look at some special goody in the backroom.

Fee - \$30
925-0447 for appt

35. PICTURE HANGING SERVICE

Paintings, photographs, pictures or drawings correctly placed and durably hung in the designated location without marring surfaces of walls.

Fee - \$25
925-0447 for appt

36. GOSSIP

Where to get the latest. How reliable the sources are. Who to tell if you want to spread a rumor.

Fee - \$10
925-0447 for appt

37. ARTIST HOUSING SERVICE

A complete service on an individual basis. You tell us the amount of space you need, what you want to use it for, how much you are willing to pay per month, and we do the leg work. Usual fees if we find something for you. No obligation if we don't. If you have something for rent, let us know; we'll pass on the word.

Fee per job
925-0447 for appt

38. LIFE ART

A series of consultations the purpose of which is to discover what aspects of the client's life may be used to induce art experience.

Fee - \$90
925-0447 for appt

39. ART RESTORATION SERVICE

Paintings that look as though they're dying can be brought back to life at our re-artifying intensive care unit.

Fee per job
925-0447 for appt

40. ART SUPPLIES FOR SCULPTORS

Names, addresses and telephone numbers of the following: fabricators, foundries, metal and stone suppliers, representatives of major architectural firms. Where to pick up usable industrial scrap for free. We translate your sketch or model into a fabricator's readable blueprint, thereby reducing cost of production.

Fee - \$10
to \$100
925-0447 for appt

41. MOVIE MONEY

How to interest possible sponsors in supporting production of movies you wish to make, but are beyond your pocketbook.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

42. DEALING WITH ARTISTS - FOR DEALERS

A complete assessment of your business relationship with your artists, including analysis of income ratio to work supplied, deductions being made, acceptable practices, just plain ripoffs and contractual fulfillments.

Fee - \$35
925-0447 for appt

43. ART SUPPLIES FOR CONCEPTUAL ARTISTS

Where to buy bond paper. Most economical ways of printing. How to obtain a cheap typewriter. Procedures for dissemination of conceptual works. Typing services and photo reproduction service.

Fee - \$10
925-0447 for appt

44. HOW TO BECOME AN ART STUDENT

List of universities and art schools. Personal assessment of your aptitude and specific matching of student to art school. What you should wear, how you should behave, whether or not you should grow a beard, the right artist bars to be seen in.

Fee - \$30
925-0447 for appt

45. HOW TO GET A SHOW AT A MUSEUM

A list of personnel from all major museums who are in a position to show your work. How to contact them.

Fee - \$10
925-0447 for appt

46. ART SUPPLIES FOR FILMMAKERS

Where to buy film at lowest cost. Which labs do the best job of processing. How to establish credit at various places so that large equipment may be rented without deposits. How to buy video tape for 2/3 of the retail price. How to buy Kodachrome movie film in foreign countries for half the price in the U.S.

Fee - \$15
925-0447 for appt

47. NAMES

Mott Art's team of copy writers will produce names for artists, critics and galleries, upon request. These names shall become the trademark or means of identification of the purchaser and shall be subject to all covering legal statute.

Fee - \$150
925-0447 for appt

48. COLOR SELECTION SERVICE

We provide the colors for your next painting. A careful assessment of all your previous paintings and some computer programming give us all the future variations.

Fee - \$40
925-0447 for appt

49. STRETCHING SERVICE

Any size canvas stretched at any location. Edges cleaned and taped.

Fee per job
925-0447 for appt

50. HOW TO EARN YOUR LIVING IN ART EDUCATION

What programs the students will think are groovy. How to keep up on current New York art trends. Which art education conventions you should attend. How, when you go to conventions, you can find out where the better paying jobs are. How to increase your earning power by increasing the number of letters after your name.

Fee - \$30
925-0447 for appt

51. ARTISTS - HOW TO DEAL WITH ART PUBLISHERS

Analysis of any contract between artist and print publisher. Advice prior to the making of any deal or signing contracts. What percent of the edition you should get when you make a print.

Fee - \$30
925-0447 for appt

52. IMAGE MAKER

A team of 4 Mott Art staff members will interview client with the purpose of restructuring his image. After such interviews, the team will then present a report on the necessary program for the restructuring of the image.

Fee - \$250
925-0447 for appt

53. INVESTIGATION SERVICE

Museum of Mott Art will investigate whereabouts of lost works of art, missing husbands or wives or artists, etc.

Fee per job
925-0447 for appt

54. ART SUPPLIES FOR ELECTRONIC ARTISTS

Where to obtain lasers. How to make contact with electronic engineers. Where to obtain custom made electronic hardware. Labs who have experience in the production of holograms. How to approach the major corporations who produce electronic equipment - for free use of their equipment.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

55. LANGUAGE SERVICES

Complete course in German and a complete course in Japanese for artists and dealers.

Fee per hour
925-0447 for appt

56. SPYING SERVICE

If you would like to know what other artists are working on but don't have access to their studios, give us a call and we will find out for you including photographs, sketches and other pertinent and reliable documents.

Fee per job
925-0447 for appt

57. ART SUPPLIES FOR COMPUTER ARTISTS

Where you can buy computer time. How to rent a telex terminal. List of producers of custom made software. Where to learn about programming for computers.

Fee - \$15
925-0447 for appt

58. TRAVEL ARRANGEMENTS

Artists, dealers, museum personnel, etc. may have complete trips arranged, domestic or foreign, from studio to Kunsthalle and back.

Fee - \$20
925-0447 for appt

59. ART STYLES

Mott Art will develop a new art style in our D & R lab upon request. All such art styles will be treated as strictly confidential and shall become the sole property of the purchaser of the style.

Fee - \$200
925-0447 for appt

60. PHOTOGRAPHIC SERVICE

Any work of art photographed in black and white or color, color slides or glossy photographs.

Fee per job
925-0447 for appt

61. CATALOGING SERVICE

We will catalog all art works, photographs, etc. Why not have Museum of Mott Art write the introduction for your next show.

Fee - \$125
925-0447 for appt

62. PUBLIC RELATIONS

Museum of Mott Art will undertake to write press releases and other promotional material and mail them to specifically interested press list.

Fee - \$100
925-0447 for appt

63. WIRE TAPPING SERVICE

Any artist, dealer, museum personnel who may require confidential information, service includes installation of necessary hardware and analysis of tape recorded phone calls.

Fee - \$300
925-0447 for appt

64. LECTURE SERVICE

Museum of Mott Art will act as agents for qualified art lecturers and represent them for lecture tours with universities and other places for speaking engagements.

Fee per job
925-0447 for appt

65. COPYING SERVICE

Mott Art will supply a copy of any painting or sculpture or conceptual work either in the same materials as the original or photographic reproduction. Fees in advance.

Fee per job
925-0447 for appt



Alex Kitnick
Les Levine's
Services

The shift from a manufacturing-based economy to a service-based system marks one of the major transitions in postwar life, at least in the United States, Canada, and other Western countries. It wasn't that things stopped getting made, of course—shoes, jeans, televisions, radios, all continued to be produced—but rather that business decided to make them elsewhere, where labour was cheaper. Cost and the bottom line decided where a car was put together, and so Fords, born in Michigan, would now be made in Mexico, amongst other places. In the wake of this manufacturing exodus, new kinds of jobs started to form in North America (though often not in the same cities or towns where things were originally made) in what would soon be called the service sector. Restaurants and hotels, also known as the hospitality industry, became ever more prominent features of the economic landscape. But where the idea of hosting stems from a concept of generosity, the service sector runs on necessity, if not desperation. It requires intimacy with another body and makes demands on the affects—being near another person and attending to their needs is at its centre—but it is ultimately transactional. And so the economy

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine's
Services*

moved closer to making social relations instead of objects and commodities. At the same time, social relations were reified into something thing-like.

It's no surprise, perhaps, that art in the West underwent a similar shift at this moment, transforming itself from something discrete and tangible to something not only harder to grasp, but also immaterial, conceptual, and dematerialized. But describing the shift in these terms doesn't account for the variety of artistic enterprises that flowered at this moment: where Lawrence Weiner's famous statement of intent undermined the value of the artwork and the labour it took to make it, Joseph Kosuth's definitions devoted themselves to shoring up a somewhat traditional, if not tautological, definition of art. Other artists, such as Dan Graham and Eduardo Costa, who planted their work in magazine pages, were more devoted to art as a form of communication, whereas figures including Michael Asher and Hans Haacke opened their practices outward to embrace the institution. Lorraine O'Grady's intersectionally-minded performances did this in other ways, too, as did the work of Adrian Piper, which explored the figure of the racialized subject not

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine's
Services*

only in the art system but in social space more generally. It was left to the artist Les Levine, however, to directly imagine that art might now be a service, which is also to say that art might have use value. The idea of art as an autonomous object of contemplation was reaching its end.¹

Many people today may not know the immense impact that Levine had on the art world of the late 1960s: in 1969 alone he staged one-person exhibitions in New York, as well as London, Los Angeles, Paris, and Sydney. While his earliest works took the form of sculptural objects (see his untitled work of 1965, which stretched thermo-plastic over a captain's chair), many could be infinitely reproduced, such as the wall-mounted vacuum-formed editions that straddle the divide between functional and useless. Soon Levine scaled up his sculpture to environmental proportions (*The Star Garden [A Place]*, which appeared in MoMA's courtyard in 1967 is emblematic), and as he did so he noticed that the environment was not empty, or simply breezy, but governed by a communication system. And in this the art world was no different than the world at large. His artworks became case studies of the type

1. Others, too, of course, must be included in this brief survey. Indeed, a separate essay could be devoted to the work of the Vancouver-based N.E. Thing Co., which offered real services (consultation, evaluation, mediation, promotion, Telex transmission) to "clients" in the artworld and beyond, and was modelled around a fictitious business/institutional identity that redefined the role of the artist.

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine's
Services*

of communication that bound the art world together: in 1966, for example, Levine made *Critic*, a video of thirteen critics speaking about the state of criticism and soon after he published *Culture Hero*, “a fanzine of stars of the art world.” Later he organized a series of “hearings,” which probed and recorded interlocutors, including the critic Gregory Battcock and the artist Malcolm Morley. And in a grand summation of these activities Levine opened Levine’s, “New York’s only Jewish-Irish-Canadian restaurant,” in partnership with Mickey Ruskin of Max’s Kansas City. Criticism, gossip, food. What more is there to say? Background was coming to the foreground, secondary information made primary. The stuff that seemed to be the ground of art began to figure in new ways.

It was Levine’s insight, however, perhaps most clearly expressed in his 1972 *Catalogue of Services*, to reveal the specific form of the art world’s mode of communication. While many exchanges in the art world might have been imagined as casual or even altruistic, as the kind of favour one might do for a friend (i.e., helping to move a painting or designing a poster), the majority of participants were, in fact,

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine’s
Services*

bound to one another in a system of services rendered and services paid. Released under the aegis of the Museum of Mott Art, Levine's thirteen-page catalogue offers sixty-five separate services ranging from "how to apply to major foundations for specific projects" to a "copying service" that "will supply a copy of any painting or sculpture or conceptual work either in the same materials as the original or photographic reproduction." Levine sent out his prospectus to a wide range of art world characters, and dropped off copies in art galleries alongside other printed matter, so that the distribution of the work, too, would not only reflect but also articulate art's network (in the same year, Lawrence Alloway published his important 1972 *Artforum* article "Network: The Art World Described as a System," which codified the art world's new reliance on information). While some of the services attend to the practicalities of studio life (see, for example, "Art Supplies for Painters") others speak more directly to the social life of artists and art workers: tips, for example, on where to be seen and how to craft a guest list for an opening, as well as a service offering lectures—an allusion, perhaps, to Warhol's

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine's
Services*

hiring of actor Allen Midgette to play him on a West Coast lecture tour. Other services, including a wire-tapping service (number 63), verge on the paranoid end of sociability, anticipating a global conversation around privacy and publicity occasioned by the release of the Watergate tapes. Perhaps most surprisingly, Levine's services got results. Promotional materials for the venture advertise the success of one "Joan Schwartz, Arts Co-ordinator": "I got my job through the Museum of Mott Art inc.," she states. (We don't learn what the job is, but she is pictured, bespectacled, in front of a massive modernist sculpture.) Two years later, in 1974, Levine published another version of his prospectus with the moniker *After Art* attached, baldly stating that services occupied the space where art once stood. Nearly forty years later critic David Joselit would adopt this term to describe art's new status, power, and social life, after the object. If Levine's work was of its time, it anticipated ours, too.

While Levine's catalogue is notable for its wry mimicry of a state of affairs, it is also notable for its prescience. In 1994, some twenty years after the appearance of the *Catalogue of Services*, artist Andrea

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine's
Services*

Fraser and critic Helmut Draxler convened a group of artists and curators in Vienna to discuss a series of similar questions. (Fraser would go on to write a number of texts on the topic, including “How to Provide an Artistic Service: An Introduction” and “What Do I, as an Artist, Provide?”). In many ways Fraser and Draxler’s mandate was more limited than Levine’s. They viewed the artist as a service worker who performed research-intensive project-based work *on* institutions, which entailed, in the well-known example of Fred Wilson’s *Mining the Museum* (1992), sussing out the racist histories embedded in their collections and organization.² Artists now received fees for services rendered instead of lump sums for objects produced. As Fraser writes, “If we are, then, accepting payment in exchange for our services, does that mean we are serving those who pay us? If not, who are we serving and on what basis are we demanding payment (and should we be demanding payment)? Or, if we are serving those who pay us, how are we serving them (and what are we serving)?”³ Yes, Levine affirmed preemptively, artists serve those who pay them: he made that quite transparent. In fact, he doubled down

TERMS

2. In Canada, the CARFAC (Canadian Artists’ Representation/ Le Front des Artistes Canadiens) which was founded in London, Ontario in 1967, established fair policies for artist copyright, and eventually extended to exhibition fees.
3. Andrea Fraser, “How to Provide an Artistic Service: An Introduction,” in *Museum Highlights: The Writings of Andrea Fraser*, ed. Alexander Alberro (Cambridge: MIT Press, 2005), 157.

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine’s
Services*

on it: his service as an artist was to provide services to others, and he made the point as transactionally as possible, his tongue gently resting in his cheek.

But Levine was not always sardonic about what art's new service-centered economy might look like. The rise of services signified a genuine paradigm shift and a new conception of art and artist alike (if the two were to continue to exist at all). At the end of his essay, "The Great American Art Machine," published in full in 1973, Levine writes, "The artist must, without question, abdicate. He must realize that his work should not contain authority"—in other words, that it should not lead but serve. "Art now reads out as social software: information," he continues. "Once we know that the purpose is to influence the social software we can do away with art and start influencing the social software directly. Beyond that the artist will probably dissolve, cease to exist in our society as a separate heroic figure."⁴ In other words, there would only be services. This prophecy may or may not have come true. While new artworks continue to be made (in fact, perhaps more are now produced than ever before) we must ask, once again, whose interests they serve and

4. Les Levine, "The Great American Art Machine," in *New Ideas in Art Education: A Critical Anthology*, ed. Gregory Battcock (New York: Dutton, 1973), 28.

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine's
Services*

who, in general, art serves: certainly, this question remains central to institutional struggles today between trustees, artists, and interested parties. And so Levine's witty pamphlet, now more than fifty years old, may be more relevant than ever.

ALEX KITNICK is Assistant Professor of Art History and Visual Culture at Bard College in Annandale-on-Hudson, New York, and a frequent contributor to publications including *Artforum* and *October*. He edited *October* 136 on New Brutalism and a collection of John McHale's writings, *The Expendable Reader: Articles on Art, Architecture, Design, and Media, 1951-1979*. His book *Distant Early Warning: Marshall McLuhan and the Transformation of the Avant-Garde* was recently published by University of Chicago Press.

Alex Kitnick
*Les Levine's
Services*

TERMS
SERVICE – PART 1
FALL 2021

Concept:
Michèle Thériault

Developed by
Julia Eilers Smith,
Robin Simpson,
Michèle Thériault

Curator, Part 1:
Julia Eilers Smith

Essays:
Dallal Boukhari,
Alex Kitnick

Artwork:
Les Levine

Editing:
Julia Eilers Smith,
Michèle Thériault

Translation:
Jo-Anne Balcaen

Design:
Karine Cossette

Publication available in digital
and printed editions

©Dallal Boukhari,
Alex Kitnick,
Leonard & Bina Ellen Art Gallery /
Concordia University

Legal Deposit
Bibliothèque et Archives
nationales du Québec
Library and Archives Canada, 2021
ISBN: 978-2-924316-32-0

ellengallery.concordia.ca

How does a term circulate through society, and how does its dissemination within contemporary discourse inform us about the way that society thinks about itself? By what means do certain words instill themselves in language and the public sphere to the point of becoming commonplace? *Terms* is an online discursive and artistic program that individually unpacks a series of broad and polysemous terms that are employed today to address a range of sociopolitical issues in contemporary society. While some words acquire multiple defini-

tions the more they are used, they also often tend to become generalized and run the risk of having their meaning become diluted, confused, or unclear over time. Nevertheless, their continued presence in our vocabulary requires careful attention and analysis as to their etymological value, their semantic density, and their use across and beyond disciplinary boundaries.

For each selected term, a researcher from outside the visual arts publishes a text that examines it in its many variants, tensions, and ambiguities through the specific lens of their

field of activity. The word is then considered by pairing it with a resonating artwork shared on the Gallery's website. In turn, a writer from the cultural sector uses this same work as the starting point for a second text that draws from the first and from beyond to probe aspects of the term in its various dimensions.

